

GENERAL STUDIES COURSE PROPOSAL COVER FORM

	nformation paste <u>curr</u>		informati	on from <u>Clas</u>	s Search/Cou	<u>rse Catalog</u> .		-		
College/School		College of Liberal Arts and Sciences		nces	Department/Scl	hool		of Civic and E nt and Leaders		
Prefix:	CEL	Number:	100	Title:	Great Ideas	of Politics and Ethics	s; K Tali	iaferro	Units:	3
surveys influen relation Confuc leaders	s ancient, 1 ces on con nship betw cius, Cicero and write	nedieval a temporary een religio), Tertullia rs from m	nd mode y debates on and po an, Aquir odernity	rn thinkers i with focus o litics. We stu as, Maimon in America :	n the Greek, n the great q udy both the ides, Al-Fara and abroad.	es and ideas of politi Jewish, Christian an uestions of human n ideas and historical ibi, Ibn Rushd (Aver This lecture course v rite analytical paper	nd Mus nature, s statesm rroes), a will incl	lim tradi ocial and anship o and Al-G ude sepa	itions, tracing d political life, f such figures hazali, as well trate discussion	their and the as Plato, as various n to
Is this a	a cross-liste	d course?	1	No	If yes, plea	ase identify course(s):	:			
Is this a	a shared co	urse?	1	No	If so, list a	ll academic units offe	ering thi	s course:		
designati	on requested.	By submitting	this letter of	f support, the ch	air/director agree	chair/director of <u>each</u> depai es to ensure that all faculty ch approved designation.				
Is this a	a permanen	t-numbered	l course v	vith topics?	Yes					
criteria	for the approtection for the the teaching the	oved designation	tion(s). It	is the responsi	bility of the ch	in a manner that meets air/director to ensure th n(s) and adhere to the ab	nat all	Chai	ir/Director Initi	als
Reques	sted design		,	Arts and Desi each designation	0	Man	datory]	Review:	(Choose one)	
	lity: Perman				mpleted the un	iversity's review and ap	pproval p	process. Fo	or the rules gove	rning approval
	ssion deadl									
				October 1, 20	17	For Spring 2	2019 Ef	fective D	ate: March 10,	2018
A single awarenes	s area requir artmental co	be proposed ements con	for more t currently, l	out may not sa	tisfy requireme	ea. A course may satisfients in two core areas sin counted toward both the	multaneo	ously, ever	n if approved for	those areas.
	sts for gen									
Comple	ete and atta	ch the appr	opriate cl	necklist						
	racy and C			ourses (L)						
	<u>hematics co</u>			alications cor	e courses (CS	2)				
						<u>)</u>				
-	Humanities, Arts and Design core courses (HU) Social-Behavioral Sciences core courses (SB)									
	Natural Sciences core courses (SQ/SG)									
	Cultural Diversity in the United States courses (C)									
	<u>bal Awaren</u> orical Awa									
	ete proposa									
It is respo	Signed co Criteria c Course ca Sample s Copy of t	burse propo hecklist for italog desc yllabus for able of cor quested th	sal cover r General ription the cours itents fror	Studies desig e n the textboo		requested equired readings/bool nically with all files		ed into or	ne PDF.	
Name	Karen '	Faliaferro		E-mail	karen.talia	ferro@asu.edu	P	Phone	414-286-424	12
			pproval:	(Required)			1			

		ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY	
Chair/Director name (Typed):	Paul Carrese		Date: August 20, 2018
Chair/Director (Signature):		Paul O. Canepe	Duc. C

Arizona State University Criteria Checklist for

HUMANITIES, ARTS AND DESIGN [HU]

Rationale and Objectives

The humanities disciplines are concerned with questions of human existence and meaning, the nature of thinking and knowing, with moral and aesthetic experience. The humanities develop values of all kinds by making the human mind more supple, critical, and expansive. They are concerned with the study of the textual and artistic traditions of diverse cultures, including traditions in literature, philosophy, religion, ethics, history, and aesthetics. In sum, these disciplines explore the range of human thought and its application to the past and present human environment. They deepen awareness of the diversity of the human heritage and its traditions and histories and they may also promote the application of this knowledge to contemporary societies.

The study of the arts and design, like the humanities, deepens the student's awareness of the diversity of human societies and cultures. The arts have as their primary purpose the creation and study of objects, installations, performances and other means of expressing or conveying aesthetic concepts and ideas. Design study concerns itself with material objects, images and spaces, their historical development, and their significance in society and culture. Disciplines in the arts and design employ modes of thought and communication that are often nonverbal, which means that courses in these areas tend to focus on objects, images, and structures and/or on the practical techniques and historical development of artistic and design traditions. The past and present accomplishments of artists and designers help form the student's ability to perceive aesthetic qualities of art work and design.

The Humanities, Arts and Design are an important part of the General Studies Program, for they provide an opportunity for students to study intellectual and imaginative traditions and to observe and/or learn the production of art work and design. The knowledge acquired in courses fulfilling the Humanities, Arts and Design requirement may encourage students to investigate their own personal philosophies or beliefs and to understand better their own social experience. In sum, the Humanities, Arts and Design core area enables students to broaden and deepen their consideration of the variety of human experience.

Revised April 2014

Proposer: Please complete the following section and attach appropriate documentation.

	ASU - [HU] CRITERIA				
	HUMANITIES, ARTS AND DESIGN [HU] courses must meet <i>either</i> 1, 2 or 3 <i>and</i> at least one of the criteria under 4 in such a way as to make the satisfaction of these criteria A CENTRAL AND SUBSTANTIAL PORTION of the course content.				
YES	NO		Identify Documentation Submitted		
\square		 Emphasizes the study of values; the development of philosophies, religions, ethics or belief systems; and/or aesthetic experience. 	Syllabus		
\square		2. Concerns the interpretation, analysis, or creation of written, aural, or visual texts; and/or the historical development of textual traditions.	Syllabus		
		3. Concerns the interpretation, analysis, or engagement with aesthetic practices; and/or the historical development of artistic or design traditions.			
		 In addition, to qualify for the Humanities, Arts and Design designation a course must meet one or more of the following requirements: 			
		 Concerns the development of human thought, with emphasis on the analysis of philosophical and/or religious systems of thought. 	Syllabus, reading list, table of contents		
		b. Concerns aesthetic systems and values, especially in literature, arts, and design.			
		c. Emphasizes aesthetic experience and creative process in literature, arts, and design.			
		d. Concerns the analysis of literature and the development of literary traditions.			
		THE FOLLOWING TYPES OF COURSES ARE EXCLUDED FROM THE [HU] DESIGNATION EVEN THOUGH THEY MIGHT GIVE SOME CONSIDERATION TO THE HUMANITIES, ARTS AND DESIGN:			
		• Courses devoted primarily to developing skill in the use of a language.			
		• Courses devoted primarily to the acquisition of quantitative or experimental methods.			
		• Courses devoted primarily to teaching skills.			

Course Prefix	Number	Title	General Studies Designation
CEL	100	Great Ideas of Politics and Ethics in Comparative Perspective	HU

Explain in detail which student activities correspond to the specific designation criteria. Please use the following organizer to explain how the criteria are being met.

Criteria (from checksheet)	How course meets spirit (contextualize specific examples in next column)	Please provide detailed evidence of how course meets criteria (i.e., where in syllabus)
1	Course reads wide selection of philosophers, theologians and social and political actors. Lectures and discussions emphasize values and beliefs, especially religious ones, and their impacts on society.	Calendar of readings, "What to Expect in Class"
2	Students will read and engage difficult, classic texts of politics and ethics from throughout history and across the globe. They will produce, peer-edit, revise and polish two substantial essays on the thinkers discussed in class and will complete pop quizzes designed to test reading comprehension of the same.	Calendar of readings; "What to Expect in Class," objectives, "Assessment and Essays"
4a	This is a course in the history of political thought with an emphasis on systems of thought arising out of various world religions (Christianity, Islam, Judaism, Hinduism and Confucianism).	Calendar of readings

Course Catalogue Description CEL 100

This course introduces fundamental debates and ideas of politics in both the West and beyond. It surveys ancient, medieval and modern thinkers in the Greek, Jewish, Christian and Muslim traditions, tracing their influences on contemporary debates with focus on the great questions of human nature, social and political life, and the relationship between religion and politics. We study both the ideas and historical statesmanship of such figures as Plato, Confucius, Cicero, Tertullian, Aquinas, Maimonides, Al-Farabi, Ibn Rushd (Averroes), and Al-Ghazali, as well as various leaders and writers from modernity in America and abroad. This lecture course will include separate discussion to encourage active learning, and students will be expected to write analytical papers and make a class presentation.

CONTENTS:

Introduction Preface to the Fifth Edition Preface to the First Edition

Sophocles: Antigone

Plato: Euthyphro; Apology; Crito; Phaedo Death Scene (115B1–118A17); Republic

Aristotle: *Nicomachean Ethics*; *Politics* (Bk. I; Bk. II, 1–5, 9; Bk. III; Bk. IV, 1–15, 16 [abridged]; Bk. VII, 1–3, 13, 15; Bk. VIII, 1–3)

Epicurus: Letter to Menoeceus; Principal Doctrines

Epictetus: Encheiridion

Augustine: City of God (Bk. XIX [abridged])

Aquinas: On Kingship (I, 1); Summa Theologica (I–II, Q.90. 1–4, Q.91. 1–4, Q.94. 1–6, Q.95. 1–4, Q.96. 1–6; II–II, Q.40. 1, Q.42. 2, Q.66. 1–2); Disputed Questions on Virtue [abridged] (On the Virtues in General, 1–9, 13; On the Cardinal Virtues, 1–2)

Machiavelli: Letter to Francesco Vettori; The Prince; Discourses (Bk. I, 1–2; Bk. II, 1–2, 20, 29; Bk. III, 1, 9)

Hobbes: Leviathan (Dedicatory, Introduction, Pt. 1–2, Review and Conclusion)

Locke: Second Treatise of Government; A Letter Concerning Toleration

Hume: Treatise of Human Nature (Bk. II, Pt. III, Sec. III; Bk. III, Pt. I, Sec. I–II; Pt. II, Sec. I–II)

Rousseau: Discourse on the Origin of Inequality; On the Social Contract

Kant: Grounding for the Metaphysics of Morals; To Perpetual Peace

Mill: On Liberty; Utilitarianism; The Subjection of Women

Marx: Alienated Labor, On the Jewish Question; Communist Manifesto; Critique of the Gotha Program

Nietzsche: On the Advantage and Disadvantage of History for Life; On the Genealogy of Morality

Weber: Politics as a Vocation

ASU - Fall 2018

CEL 100 – Honors Section Great Ideas of Politics and Ethics in Comparative Perspective

This course introduces fundamental debates and ideas of politics in both the West and beyond. It surveys ancient, medieval and modern thinkers in the Greek, Jewish, Christian and Muslim traditions, tracing their influences on contemporary debates with focus on the great questions of human nature, social and political life, and the relationship between religion and politics. We study both the ideas and historical statesmanship of such figures as Plato, Cicero, Tertullian, Aquinas, Saadyah Gaon, Maimonides, Al-Farabi, Ibn Rushd (Averroes), and Al-Ghazali, as well as various modern leaders and writers in America and abroad. This lecture course will include separate discussion to encourage active learning, and students will be expected to write analytical papers and make a class presentation.

Instructor

Professor Karen Taliaferro Office: Coor 6658; email: Karen.taliaferro@asu.edu Office Hours: After class and by appointment

Course Description and Learning Objectives

CEL 101 introduces students to the history of moral and political thought from antiquity to modernity, highlighting key debates and intellectual trends in classic texts. Combining readings from Michael Morgan's *Classics of Moral and Political Theory* with classroom lectures, it aims to present the main ethical, political and cultural debates in Western civilizational history and beyond. On successful completion of the course, students will have acquired:

- (a) familiarity with leading political and ethical texts;
- (b) knowledge of historical models of leadership from Mohammad to Martin Luther King, Jr.;
- (c) an introduction to the interplay of civic and political thought with philosophical and religious debates.

Required Materials

The only book required is Michael L. Morgan, *Classics of Moral and Political Theory*, Fifth Edition (Hackett, 2011), available at the ASU bookstore and online. Additional required readings will be made available to students via the course Blackboard site. Whether from book or blackboard, readings are to be completed *prior* to class meetings.

Assessment and Essays

Students' performance in the course will be assessed according to a 100-point scale:

- 1) A maximum of 30 points for six in-class quizzes (five points each) in the course of the semester; the quizzes will be unannounced, and cannot be made up after the fact;
- 1) A maximum of 25 points for the midterm essay (approximately 1200 words), due **Friday, October 19**; this should analyze the thought of one of the thinkers we have discussed in class up to fall break.
- 2) A maximum of 45 points for the take-home final examination/essay (approximately 2500 words*) due in draft form Thursday, November 29 in class and in final form Wednesday, December 5 at 5 p.m.; this should incorporate your revised first essay and add another thinker from the second half of the semester.

*It is often said that a good essay is not written, it is rewritten. To that end, your final exam will be a product of your writing during the entire semester. You will choose a theme, *highly recommended* in consultation with

me, that can extend across different thinkers and time periods, then begin work on your essay, proceeding in three parts:

- First, an essay on one thinker, discussed in the first half of the semester, and one theme, due as your midterm essay on **Friday, October 19 (emailed to me by 5 p.m.)**. I will grade and provide extensive feedback on that essay by the **first week in November**.
- Second, a discussion of a thinker we have discussed in the second half of the semester, addressing the same theme. This is due **in class** *only* as a draft for our writing workshop on the last day of class, **Thursday, November 29**.
- Third, your final exam/essay, which will combine the two first essays, incorporating revisions as suggested by my feedback and your peers' evaluations during the writing workshop, then combine the essays and provide your own analysis of the theme across the two sources. This is due to my inbox by **5 p.m. on Wednesday, December 5**.

Example:

Theme: Equality and Inequality

- First essay: Discussing Aristotle's Politics
 - How does Aristotle treat the idea of equality of citizens? Does this affect his idea of what democracy is and whether it is feasible or even advisable?
- Second essay: Discussing Qutb's Islam is the Real Civilization.
 - Does Qutb's vision of Islam allow for a society in which all citizens are equals? How or how not? Does religion advance or inhibit equality? Why/how, according to Qutb?
- Final essay: After combining the two essays, you will provide your own evaluation of equality and inequality in light of the two texts. How, given what you have learned from these two thinkers, is equality best advanced in a society? Does equality come at a price, e.g., do (as some thinkers have suggested) freedom and equality stand in tension with each other, or is more equality always a good thing? Does Aristotle's or Qutb's vision of politics better achieve equality? Does one or the other thinker understand inequality in society better than the other?

Whichever theme and thinkers you choose, it is important always to **support your argument with text**. We will discuss this in class prior to the midterm as well as in an in-class writing workshop during the final week of class, during which you will also evaluate your peers' essays (in pairs). All of this is intended to help you better compose a final essay—honing your writing and analytical skills more generally in the process.

Essays should be submitted, in Microsoft Word or similar format (i.e., NOT pdf, please!), by 5 p.m. on their due dates, to me at karen.taliaferro@asu.edu.

What to expect in class

Attendance at all class meetings is required – almost a third of your grade is stake, thanks to those pop quizzes! For this class to be a success, we need active engagement with the texts as well as with your classmates and me as your professor. This means reading with an eye not only for content—i.e., "what is the author saying?"—but also for comprehension—"what does it mean? What are the implications?"—as well as comparison between a given text and other texts we have read.

Please notify me should it be necessary to miss all or part of a class meeting for whatever reason (and note that unexcused absences are no good for your participation grade). If you need to miss a class for either religious observance or university-sanctioned activities, please see me **in advance** of the absence.

In order to devote full attention to our seminar discussion (and <u>lower stress levels</u>), I ask that you refrain from using electronics, including but not limited to laptops and phones, during class. Students are expected to

demonstrate respect for themselves, each other and the professor and avoid disruptive behavior. Please feel free to address me with any questions or for clarification.

Grading Scale:	
A+ 99-100	B- 80-82
A 93-98	C+ 77-79
A- 90-92	C 70-76
B+ 87-89	D 69-65
B 83-86	E 64 or less

Calendar of Readings

- Week 1 (August 16-17): Course introduction, no readings assigned
- Week 2 (August 20-24): Plato's *Republic* (selections, in Morgan)
- Week 3 (August 27-31): Aristotle's Nicomachean Ethics and Politics (selections, in Morgan)
- Week 4 (September 4-7; Sept. 3 is Labor Day): Ancient Eastern Thought
 - Bhagavad Gita (Blackboard)
 - o Confucian's Analects (Blackboard)
- Week 5 (Sept 10-14): Jewish and Christian scriptures
 - o Selections from Genesis, Exodus, I Samuel (Blackboard);
 - Consider Yoram Hazony, "<u>Does the Bible Have a Political Teaching</u>?" from *Hebraic* Political Studies (Winter 2006); also see interview with Hazony on <u>Jon Silver's podcast</u>
 - o Christianity selections from the New Testament (Matthew, Acts and the writings of St. Paul)
- Week 6 (September 17-21): Early Islam selections from the Qur'an, Hadith of Al-Bukhari and the Life of Muhammad (Blackboard)
- Week 7 (September 24-28): Medieval Jewish thought:
 - o Maimonides, selection from Guide for the Perplexed
 - o Saadyah Gaon, selections from The Book of Beliefs and Opinions (Blackboard)
- Week 8 (October 1-5): Medieval Christian thought
 - Augustine, selection from *The City of God* (Morgan)
 - o Thomas Aquinas, On Kingship and Summa Theologica (Morgan)
- Week 9 (October 10-12; Oct. 8-9 are fall break): Medieval Islamic thought
 - o Averroes' Decisive Treatise (Blackboard)

- o Alfarabi, Attainment of Happiness (Blackboard)
- Week 10 (October 15-19): Early modernity: Hobbes' Leviathan (and Machiavelli's Prince?) (Morgan)

• MIDTERM DUE OCTOBER 19 (FRIDAY)!

- Week 11 (October 22-26): Rousseau, *Discourse on Inequality* and *Social Contract* (selections, both in Morgan)
- Week 12 (October 29-November 2): Tocqueville, *Democracy in America* (Morgan)
- Week 13 (November 5-9): Nietzsche, *Genealogy of Morality* (Morgan)
- Week 14 (November 13-16; Nov. 12 is Veterans' Day):
 - o Tuesday November 13: Sayyid Qutb, Milestones, chapter 7: "Islam is the Real Civilization,"
 - o Thursday, November 15: Nasr Abu Zayd, <u>The Qur'anic Concept of Justice</u> chapter 8.
- Week 15 (November 19-21; 22-23 are Thanksgiving Break):
 - o Tuesday, November 20: Martin Luther King, Jr., Letter from a Birmingham Jail
- Week 16 (November 26-30):
 - o Tuesday, November 27: Mohandas Gandhi
 - <u>Autobiography, or The Story of My Experiments with the Truth</u>, chapters 10 ("Glimpses of Religion"), 20 ("Acquaintance with Religions") and 21 ("Nirbal Ke Bal Ram")
 - "Nonviolent Resistance" speech
 - "<u>To Every Englishman Living in India</u>," Letters 1 and 2, pp.26-38

• Thursday, November 29: Writing Workshop: Draft of second essay due in class

Study Days (December 1-2)

Final exam (take-home) due electronically by 5 p.m. on Wednesday, December 4

Appendix 1: Further information on the course and policies

Academic Integrity

Academic honesty is expected of all students in all examinations, papers and laboratory work, academic transactions and records. The possible sanctions include, but are not limited to, appropriate grade penalties, course failure (indicated on the transcript as an E), course failure due to academic dishonesty (indicated on the transcript as a grade of XE), loss of registration privileges, disqualification and dismissal. For more information, see http://provost.asu.edu/academicintegrity.

Students with Disabilities

Students who feel they will need disability accommodation in this class but have not registered with the Disability Resource Center (DRC) should contact DRC immediately. The DRC Tempe office is located of the Matthews Center Building. DRC staff can also be reached at: 480-965-1234 (V) or 480-965-4000 (TTY). For additional information, visit <u>www.asu.edu/studentaffairs/ed/drc</u>.

Policy against threatening behavior

In keeping with university policy, all incidents and allegations of violent or threatening conduct by an ASU student whether on or off campus must be reported to the ASU Police Department (ASU PD) and the Office of the Dean of Students. If either office determines that the behavior poses or has posed a serious threat to personal safety or to the welfare of the campus, the student will not be permitted to return to campus or reside in any ASU residence hall until an appropriate threat assessment has been completed and, if necessary, conditions for return are imposed. ASU PD, the Office of the Dean of Students, and other appropriate offices will coordinate the assessment in light of the relevant circumstances.

Title IX

Title IX is a federal law that provides that no person be excluded on the basis of sex from participation in, be denied benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity. Both Title IX and university policy make clear that sexual violence and harassment based on sex is prohibited. An individual who believes they have been subjected to sexual violence or harassed on the basis of sex can seek support, including counseling and academic support, from the university. If you or someone you know has been harassed on the basis of sex or sexually assaulted, you can find information and resources at https://sexualviolenceprevention.asu.edu/faqs.

As a mandated reporter, I am obligated to report any information I become aware of regarding alleged acts of sexual discrimination, including sexual violence and dating violence. ASU Counseling Services, <u>https://eoss.asu.edu/counseling</u>, is available if you wish discuss any concerns confidentially and privately.

Technology

You will need the following technology (at home, not in class!) in order to complete the work for this course:

- 1) A reliable computer and stable high speed internet access
- 2) Acrobat Reader and Microsoft Word or comparable word processing software

Please be sure to back up all of your work in case of a technology failure. If you have any technology-related difficulties, please contact the ASU Help Desk at 480.965.6500. Remember: keep copies of all your assignments; back up all of your work!

Appendix 2: START HERE FOR RESEARCH

Not all research tools are created equally, and certainly not all online content counts when you're trying to learn something true. Below are a few good places to start:

1) Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy: plato.stanford.edu

Start here instead of Wikipedia. Just about every thinker and major topic we tackle in this class has an entry, or is covered in another entry, in the SEP. Want to know more about Plato's *Republic*? (Hint: yes.) There's an entry on ethics and politics in the *Republic* on SEP. Or do you want to read about Gandhi's approach to social change? Check out "Pacificism" or "Civil Disobedience." Every entry is written by a professor who has studied the topic or thinker for years, so you know that you're getting a well-researched view. Also, don't miss the bibliography at the end of every entry; that's another great starting point for research.

2) The Great Thinkers: the great thinkers.org

Here, too, you'll find the majority of the thinkers we discuss in this class covered with introductions, video interviews and helpful bibliographies. There's a strong influence of Leo Strauss in the selection of thinkers and in the interpretations presented—and if you don't know who Leo Strauss is, hey look! He's got his own SEP entry©

3) History of Philosophy without Gaps: historyofphilosophy.net

This podcast series is ambitious as it sounds—it covers many major figures of history of philosophy in the West, Judaism, Islam, Byzantium, India and Africa from early antiquity to early modernity. The podcasts are fairly easily digestible (and only about 20 minutes each) so make for a great introduction to a new thinker or topic, review of someone we've covered in class or a more in-depth exploration of something you're curious about.

4) Great Books Podcast: www.nationalreview.com/podcasts/the-great-books/

Another podcast series, this one covers not only books you might expect (Thucydides' *History of the Peloponnesian War*, Homer's *Odyssey*) but also more fiction and modern works (T.S. Eliot's *The Waste Land*, F. Scott Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby* and Laura Ingalls Wilder's *Little House on the Prairie*). As with most podcasts, this may be less of a "research" source in the sense that you would cite it in your papers, but you could well get good ideas for a paper or be introduced to new books and ideas from listening to them.

	Strong Work	Needs Development	Unsatisfactory
Audience	Assumes audience is student who has read assigned texts carefully; paper uses evidence to make points rather than to summarize	Spends inappropriate amount of time merely summarizing text or repeating material covered in class	Shows little evidence of having read the text; ideas mostly taken from class notes or class discussion
Thesis	Single clear thesis that would be insightful and interesting to someone who had already studied the texts	Thesis is either somewhat unclear or all too obvious to most thoughtful readers	No clear thesis, or multiple theses
Introductory paragraph(s)	Avoids inflated generalizations and gratuitous praise; sets brief context; introduces clear thesis	Extraneous generalization; connection to thesis not entirely clear thesis statement not clear	No clear thesis statement or sense of where the paper is going
Paragraphs in body of paper	Strong topic sentences, supported by evidence and argumentation; topic sentences support main thesis	Some topic sentences do not support thesis, or are not supported by evidence in paragraph	No topic sentences; or little relationship between topic sentences and thesis; or no evidence for topic sentences
Argument	All necessary points in proving or developing thesis are made; makes compelling argument for thesis; paper does not assume reader agrees with author	Some missteps are made in proving or developing thesis; argument only compelling to someone who already agrees	Essay fails to prove or develop any sort of compelling thesis
Organization	Argument intelligently ordered and easy to follow, reflected in order of points and paragraphs		Material is disorganized with no clear logical order between points and/or paragraphs
Use of Evidence	Draws evidence from close reading of a variety of passages; evidence is appropriate to points being made; al quotations cited using Chicago format		Little evidence used; does not support points made; drawn entirely from class discussion; material quoted without citation
Conclusion	Hints at implications, broader conclusions, or insightful ideas to think about, based on analysis so far	Summarizes everything that has been said so far but does not leave the reader with something further to think about	satisfactory conclusion and/or
Mechanics	Nearly flawless grammar, spelling, and word choice; sentences read smoothly and are clear without being wordy	Grammar, spelling, word choice, sentence structure and/or word economy need attention	Serious problems with grammar, spelling, word choice, sentence structure and/or word economy

An A-level paper will be strong in most categories; B papers will be strong in some but need development in others; C papers need significant development; D papers are typically unsatisfactory in most categories; most people who get F's haven't read these criteria.